

1. Introduction

1.1 Workshop Time and Place

The SEDAR 32 Review Workshop for South Atlantic blueline tilefish (*Caulolatilus microps*) was held August 27-30 in Morehead City, NC. It was held in conjunction with the Review Workshop for SEDAR 32A for Gulf of Mexico menhaden (*Brevortia patronus*).

1.2 Terms of Reference

1. Evaluate the data used in the assessment, addressing the following:
 - a) Are data decisions made by the DW and AW sound and robust?
 - b) Are data uncertainties acknowledged, reported, and within normal or expected levels?
 - c) Are data applied properly within the assessment model?
 - d) Are input data series reliable and sufficient to support the assessment approach and findings?
2. Evaluate the methods used to assess the stock, taking into account the available data.
 - a) Are methods scientifically sound and robust?
 - b) Are assessment models configured properly and used consistent with standard practices?
 - c) Are the methods appropriate for the available data?
3. Evaluate the assessment findings with respect to the following:
 - a) Are abundance, exploitation, and biomass estimates reliable, consistent with input data and population biological characteristics, and useful to support status inferences?
 - b) Is the stock overfished? What information helps you reach this conclusion?
 - c) Is the stock undergoing overfishing? What information helps you reach this conclusion?
 - d) Is there an informative stock recruitment relationship? Is the stock recruitment curve reliable and useful for evaluation of productivity and future stock conditions?
 - e) Are the quantitative estimates of the status determination criteria for this stock reliable? If not, are there other indicators that may be used to inform managers about stock trends and conditions?
4. Evaluate the stock projections, addressing the following:
 - a) Are the methods consistent with accepted practices and available data?
 - b) Are the methods appropriate for the assessment model and outputs?
 - c) Are the results informative and robust, and useful to support inferences of probable future conditions?
 - d) Are key uncertainties acknowledged, discussed, and reflected in the projection results?

5. Consider how uncertainties in the assessment, and their potential consequences, are addressed.
 - Comment on the degree to which methods used to evaluate uncertainty reflect and capture the significant sources of uncertainty in the population, data sources, and assessment methods.
 - Ensure that the implications of uncertainty in technical conclusions are clearly stated.
6. Consider the research recommendations provided by the Data and Assessment workshops and make any additional recommendations or prioritizations warranted.
 - Clearly denote research and monitoring that could improve the reliability of, and information provided by, future assessments.
 - Provide recommendations on possible ways to improve the SEDAR process.
7. Provide guidance on key improvements in data or modeling approaches which should be considered when scheduling the next assessment.
8. Prepare a Peer Review Summary summarizing the Panel’s evaluation of the stock assessment and addressing each Term of Reference. Develop a list of tasks to be completed following the workshop. Complete and submit the Peer Review Summary Report in accordance with the project guidelines.

1.3 List of Participants

Review Workshop Panelists

Steve Cadrin	Review Panel Chair	SAFMC SSC
Churchill Grimes	Reviewer	SAFMC SSC
Will Patterson	Reviewer	GSMFC Appointee
Gary Melvin	Reviewer	CIE
Stephen Smith	Reviewer	CIE
Kevin Stokes	Reviewer	CIE

Analytical Team

Kevin Craig	Lead analyst, SA BLT	NMFS Beaufort
Amy Scheuller	Lead analyst, GoM menhaden	NMFS Beaufort
Kyle Shertzer	Assessment Team	NMFS Beaufort
Erik Williams	Assessment Team	NMFS Beaufort
Katie Andrew	Assessment Team	NMFS Beaufort
Rob Cheshire	Assessment Team	NMFS Beaufort
Robert Leaf	Assessment Team	USM

Observers

Dewey Hemilright	Fishing Industry	Commercial, NC
Robert Johnson	Fishing Industry	Charter/Headboat, FL

GSMFC Menhaden Advisory Committee

John Mareska, ADCNR-MRD

Behzad Mahmoudi, FL FWC

Jerry Mambretti, TPWD

Borden Wallace, Daybrook Fisheries

Ron Lukens, Omega Protein, Inc.

Matt Hill, MDMR

Harry Blanchet, LDWF

Council Representative

Michelle Duval

Council Member

SAFMC

Council and Agency Staff

Julia Byrd

SEDAR Coordinator

SEDAR

Julie O'Dell

Administration

SEDAR/SAFMC

Michael Errigo

Fishery Biologist

SAFMC Staff

Steve VanderKooy

IJF Program Coordinator

GSMFC

Jessica Stephen

Fishery Biologist

SERO

Brian Langseth

Observer

SEFSC Beaufort

Joe Smith

Observer

NOAA

Data workshop observers

Tony Austin

Doug Vaughan

Mike Prager

Robert O'Boyle

1.4 List of Data Workshop Working Papers

South Atlantic blueline tilefish and gray triggerfish reference workshop document list.

Document #	Title	Authors
Documents Prepared for the Review Workshop		
SEDAR32-RW01	The Beaufort Assessment Model (BAM) with application to blueline tilefish: mathematical description, implementation details, and computer code	NMFS-SFB 2013
SEDAR32-RW02	Catch Curves for blueline tilefish from the commercial handline and longline fleets	NMFS-SFB 2013
Reference Documents		
SEDAR32-RD01	List of documents and working papers for SEDAR 4 (Caribbean – Atlantic Deepwater Snapper Grouper) – all documents available on the SEDAR website.	SEDAR 4
SEDAR32-RD02	Comparison of Reef Fish Catch per Unit Effort	Rudershausen et al.

	and Total Mortality between the 1970s and 2005–2006 in Onslow Bay, North Carolina	2008
SEDAR32-RD03	Source document for the snapper-grouper fishery of the South Atlantic region.	SAFMC 1983
SEDAR32-RD04	FMP, regulatory impact review, and final environmental impact statement for the SG fishery of the South Atlantic region	SAFMC 1983
SEDAR32-RD05	Age, growth and reproductive biology of blueline tilefish along the southeastern coast of the United States, 1982-99	Harris et al. 2004
SEDAR32-RD06	List of documents and working papers for SEDAR 9 (Gulf of Mexico Gray Triggerfish, Greater Amberjack, and Vermillion Snapper)	SEDAR 9
SEDAR32-RD07	Estimated Conversion Factors for Adjusting MRFSS Gulf of Mexico Red Snapper Catch Estimates and Variances in 1981-2003 to MRIP Estimates and Variances	Rios et al. 2012
SEDAR32-RD08	Estimates of Historic Recreational Landings of Spanish Mackerel in the South Atlantic Using the FHWAR Census Method	Brennan and Fitzpatrick 2012
SEDAR32-RD09	Excerpt from ASMFC Atlantic Croaker Stock Assessment & Peer Review Reports 2003 – Information on Jacquard Index	ASMFC 2003
SEDAR32-RD10	Survival estimates for demersal reef fishes released by anglers	Collins 1994
SEDAR32-RD11	Indirect estimation of red snapper (<i>Lutjanus campechanus</i>) and gray triggerfish (<i>Balistes capriscus</i>) release mortality	Patterson et al. 2002
SEDAR32-RD12	Estimating discard mortality of black sea bass (<i>Centropristis striata</i>) and other reef fish in North Carolina using a tag-return approach	Rudershausen et al. 2010
SEDAR32-RD13	Commercial catch composition with discard and immediate release mortality proportions off the southeastern coast of the United States	Stephen and Harris 2010
SEDAR32-RD14	Migration and Standing Stock of Fishes Associated with Artificial and Natural Reefs on Georgia's Outer Continental Shelf	Ansley & Harris 1981
SEDAR32-RD15	Age, Growth, and Reproductive Biology of the Gray Triggerfish (<i>Balistes capriscus</i>) from the Southeastern United States, 1992-1997	Moore 2001

SEDAR32-RD16	Size, growth, temperature, and the natural mortality of marine fish	Gislason et al. 2010
SEDAR32-RD17	Evolutionary assembly rules for fish life histories	Charnov et al. 2012
SEDAR32-RD18	A Review for Estimating Natural Mortality in Fish Populations	Siegfried & Sansó